STEPHEN A. ZAPPALA, JR. DISTRICT ATTORNEY



OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY

County of Allegheny

436 GRANT STREET, 401 COURTHOUSE ♦ PITTSBURGH, PENNSYLVANIA 15219-2489 PHONE (412) 350-4377 ♦ FAX (412) 350-3312

Ms. Kimberly Lucas P.O. Box 213 Muse, PA 15350 March 4, 2022

Laurence J. Christian Open Records Officer Municipality of Bethel Park 5100 West Liberty Avenue Bethel Park, PA 15102

In re: Right to Know Law Appeal; AP 2022-00543

Dear Ms. Lucas and Open Records Officer Christian:

I am the Open Records Appeals officer for Allegheny County. As you know, the Office of Open Records (OOR) referred the present case to me to determine whether the Agency properly invoked the criminal investigative exemption in denying Ms. Lucas' request for the following items:

Police Report, Complaint, Incident Report, Lab Results for Drug Screen for D.U.I./D.W.I., Printed transcript Records, All Documents for D.U.I. Case-for DANIEL ROBERT CORDERA D.O.B. 10/17/1984 Arrest Date-11/02/2021 Issued/File Date: 11/04/2021 Arresting Dept. Bethel Park Complaint No:ASAP-607525 Incident No: 20211019M7083 OTN G 898600-3 Docket Transcript Printed 1/13/2022 Docket MJ-05220-CR-0000348-2021

See Request sent by Ms. Lucas to Municipality of Bethel Park, dated 1/31/22.

In denying the request Mr. Christian stated, inter alia, the following:

The Municipality has completed its review of your Request and your Request for these reports is denied pursuant to Section 708(b)(16) of the RTKL which exempts from disclosure a "record of an agency relating to or resulting in a criminal investigation, including: . . . [i]nvestigative materials, notes, correspondence, videos and reports. 65 P.S. §67.708(b)(16) (emphasis added).

"Investigative material" is defined in the Criminal History Record Information Act ("CHRIA"), 18 Pa. C.S. §§ 9101-9183, as "information assembled as a result of the performance of any inquiry, formal or informal, into a criminal incident or an allegation of criminal wrongdoing and may include modus operandi information." 18 Pa. C.S. §9102. The Commonwealth Court has previously concluded that material exempt from disclosure as "criminal investigative information" under the RTKL includes police incident reports and the witness statements contained therein. See e.g., Barros v. Martin, 92 A.3d 1243, 1250 (Pa. Cmwlth. 2014) (criminal complaint file, forensic lab reports, polygraph reports and witness statements rise to level of criminal investigative information exempt from disclosure); Pennsylvania State Police v. Office of Open Records, 5 A.3d 473, 478-79 (Pa. Cmwlth. 2010) (incident report prepared by police with notes of interviews of alleged victim and perpetrators assembled during investigation exempt as criminal investigative information).

Because this report relates to a criminal investigation, they are exempt under Section 708(b)(16) and your Request is denied. Criminal investigative records remain exempt from disclosure under the RTKL even after the investigation is completed. <u>Barrios v. Martin, 92 A.3d 1243, 1250 (Pa. Cmwlth. Ct. 2014).</u>

See letter dated 2/25/22 (emphasis in original).

Under 65 P.S. §67.708(b)(16) the following records are exempt from disclosure:

- (16) A record of an agency relating to or resulting in a criminal investigation, including:
- (i) Complaints of potential criminal conduct other than a private criminal complaint.
- (ii) Investigative materials, notes, correspondence, videos and reports.
- (iii) A record that includes the identity of a confidential source or the identity of a suspect who has not been charged with an offense to whom confidentiality has been promised.
- (iv) A record that includes information made confidential by law or court order.
- (v) Victim information, including any information that would jeopardize the safety of the victim.
- (vi) A record that if disclosed, would do any of the following:
 - (A) Reveal the institution, progress or result of a criminal investigation, except the filing of criminal charges.
 - (B) Deprive a person of the right to a fair or an impartial adjudication.
 - (C) Impair the ability to locate a defendant or codefendant.
 - (D) Hinder an agency's ability to secure an arrest, prosecution or conviction.
 - (E) Endanger the life or physical safety of an individual.

As the Office of Open Records explained in *Jones v. Pennsylvania Game Commission, OOR Dkt. AP 2009-0196* even records pertaining to a closed criminal investigation remain protected because Section 708(b)(16) expressly protects records relating to the result of a criminal investigation and thus remain protected even after the investigation ends. *See also, State Police v. Office of Open Records, 5* A.3d 473 (Pa. Cmwlth. 2010); *Sherry v. Radnor Twp. School District, 20* A.3d 515 (Pa. Cmwlth. 2011).

I understand Ms. Lucas' frustration:

I want to be honest with you, I'm not sure why I am having issues receiving these records. The law is the law and it's my right to request these records. I'm not trying to be impolite. I feel with these 2 statements that are untrue . . . we are already off to a bad start. I have no problem retaining counsel to handle this matter.

The reason why I am being so persistent on this matter is because my child is (sic) the car with her father (Daniel Cordera) every weekend. I am worried for the safety of my daughter, if he is using drugs or drinking again. I would like this paragraph and the correspondence between you and I to be on the record. I want to be clear about being a concerned parent so you can understand where I am coming from.

See email correspondence dated 2/17/22.

Under §703 of the Right To Know Law (RTKL) a requestor's intent or reason for requesting a record is not a factor that can be considered. I note this because I have been the Appeals Officer for Allegheny County since the law was enacted and I have seen many instances where I felt that individuals should have been given records that I found to be exempt: a parent whose child committed suicide and wanted the police report to bring closure; a homeowner wanting a police report of a burglary or theft to provide to their insurance company. Pennsylvania's RTKL is simply not as broad as the Commonwealth's citizens believe it to be, and towards that end, it should probably be amended. The law lets us all request, but it doesn't give us all access to what we would like to have accessible.

As both a prosecutor and the Appeals officer, I have access to documents that have now been filed in the Court of Common Pleas regarding this request. Specifically, I have been able to access the Magistrate's Docket and the Trial Court Docket in the case of Commonwealth v. Daniel Cordera. At this writing, they are public court documents located in the Department of Court Records, Allegheny County Court of Common Pleas, Criminal Division. I have printed those out and have included them herein. I have no authority to provide the other requested items however, as they are indeed, exempt as criminal investigative materials.

As a result, I must decline Ms. Lucas' request and affirm the denial of access. Please be advised that pursuant to Section 65 P.S. §67.1302 the parties have 30 days to appeal my decision to the Court of Common Pleas of Allegheny County. I want to thank all parties for their cooperation.

Very truly yours,

Michael W. Streily

Deputy District Attorney

Open Records Appeals Officer

Magisterial District Judge 05-2-20



Docket Number: MJ-05220-CR-0000348-2021

Criminal Docket



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania v.

Daniel Robert Cordera

Page 1 of 3

CASE INFORMATION

<u>Judge Assigned:</u> Magisterial District Judge Ronald A.

G 898600-3

Issue Date:

11/02/2021

An

Amoni

File Date:

11/02/2021

Arresting Agency:

Bethel Park Police Dept

Arrest Date:

11/04/2021

Complaint No.:

ASAP-607525

Incident No.:
Disposition Date:

20211019M7083 01/13/2022

Disposition: County:

OTN:

Waived for Court Allegheny

Township:

Bethel Park Borough

Case Status:

Closed

STATUS INFORMATION

Case Status

Status Date

Processing Status

Closed

01/21/2022 Case Transferred to Court of Common Pleas

01/13/2022

Completed

11/02/2021

Awaiting Preliminary Hearing

CALENDAR EVENTS

Case Calendar
Event Type

<u>Schedule</u>

Start Time Room

Judge Name

Schedule Status

Preliminary Hearing

Start Date 12/02/2021

int lime Roo

Magisterial District Judge

Magisterial District Judge

Status Continued

1:00 pm

1:00 pm

Ronald A. Arnoni

Scheduled

Preliminary Hearing

01/13/2022

Ronald A, Arnoni

Formal Arraignment

03/03/2022

11:00 am

519 Courthouse

Scheduled

DEFENDANT INFORMATION

Name:

Cordera, Daniel Robert

10/17/1984

Sex:

Male

Date of Birth: Address(es):

Home

Dittabased DA 4500

Race:

White

Pittsburgh, PA 15236

Advised of His Right to Apply for Assignment of Counsel?

No

Public Defender Requested by the Defendant?

Application Provided for Appointment of Public Defender?

No No

Has the Defendant Been Fingerprinted?

MDJS 1200 Printed: 03/04/2022 10:43 am

Recent entries made in the court fiting offices may not be immediately reflected on these docket sheets. Neither the courts of the Unified Judicial System of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assumes any liability for inaccurate or delayed datal, errors or omissions on these docket sheets. Docket sheet information should not be used in place of a criminal history background check, which can only be provided by the Pennsylvania State Police. Employers who do not compty with the provisions of the Criminal History Record Information Act (18 Pa.C.S. Section 9101 et seq.) may be subject to civil liability as set forth in 18 Pa.C.S. Section 9183.

Magisterial District Judge 05-2-20



DOCKET

Docket Number: MJ-05220-CR-0000348-2021

Criminal Docket



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Daniel Robert Cordera

Page 2 of 3

CASE PARTICIPANTS

Participant Type Participant Name Arresting Officer Alward, Cody P. Defendant Cordera, Daniel Robert

Ball Set: Nebbia Status: None

Bail Action Type Bail Action Date Bail Type Percentage **Amount** Set 01/13/2022 Nonmonetary \$0.00

CHARGES

| # Charge | <u>Grade</u> | Description | Offense Dt. | Disposition |
|--------------------|--------------|--|-------------|------------------|
| 1 75 § 3802 §§ D2* | М | DUI: Controlled Substance - Impaired Ability - 1st | 10/19/2021 | Waived for Court |
| | | Offense | | |
| 2 75 § 1501 §§ A | S | Driving W/O A License | 10/19/2021 | Withdrawn |
| 3 75 § 3309 §§ 1 | S | Disregard Traffic Lane (Single) | 10/19/2021 | Waived for Court |
| 4 75 § 3361 | s | Driving at Safe Speed | 10/19/2021 | Waived for Court |
| 5 75 § 3802 §§ D1* | | DUI: Controlled Substance or Metabolite 1st Offense | 10/19/2021 | Waived for Court |

DISPOSITION / SENTENCING DETAILS

| Case Disposition | Disposition Date | Was Defendant Present? |
|--|--------------------------------------|--|
| Waived for Court | 01/13/2022 | Yes |
| Offense Seg./Description 1 DUI: Controlled Substance - Impaired Ability - 1st Offense | Offense Disposition Waived for Court | |
| 2 Driving W/O A License | Withdrawn | |
| 3 Disregard Traffic Lane (Single) | Waived for Court | |
| 4 Driving at Safe Speed | Waived for Court | ************************************** |
| 5 DUI: Controlled Substance or Metabolite 1st Offense | Waived for Court | |

MDJ\$ 1200 Page 2 of 3 Printed: 03/04/2022 10:43 am

Magisterial District Judge 05-2-20



Docket Number: MJ-05220-CR-0000348-2021

Criminal Docket



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
v.
Daniel Robert Cordera

Page 3 of 3

ATTORNEY INFORMATION

Public Defender

Name: Michael Dewitt Barry, Esq.
Representing: Cordera, Daniel Robert

Counsel Status: Active
Supreme Court No.: 330589
Phone No.: 412-350-2400

Address: Allegheny County Public Defender's Office

542 Forbes Ave # 400 Pittsburgh, PA 15219

| Filed Date | Entry | <u>Filer</u> | Applies To |
|------------|-------------------------------|--|----------------------------------|
| 01/13/2022 | Waiver of Preliminary Hearing | Daniel Robert Cordera | Daniel Robert Cordera, Defendant |
| 01/13/2022 | Waived for Court | Magisterial District Judge Ronald A. Arnoni | Daniel Robert Cordera, Defendant |
| 01/13/2022 | Docket Transcript Printed | Magisterial District Court 05-2-20 | Daniel Robert Cordera, Defendant |
| 11/25/2021 | First Class Summons Accepted | Magisterial District Court 05-2-20 | Daniel Robert Cordera, Defendant |
| 11/22/2021 | Fingerprint Order Issued | Magisterial District Court 05-2-20 | Daniel Robert Cordera, Defendant |
| 11/06/2021 | Certified Summons Accepted | Magisterial District Court 05-2-20 | Daniel Robert Cordera, Defendant |
| 11/04/2021 | Fingerprint Order Issued | Magisterial District Court 05-2-20 | Daniel Robert Cordera, Defendant |
| 11/04/2021 | Summons Issued | Magisterial District Court 05-2-20 | Daniel Robert Cordera, Defendant |
| 11/04/2021 | Certified Summons Issued | Magisterial District Court 05-2-20 | Daniel Robert Cordera, Defendant |
| 11/04/2021 | First Class Summons Issued | Magisterial District Court 05-2-20 | Daniel Robert Cordera, Defendant |
| 11/02/2021 | Criminal Complaint Filed | Magisterial District Court 05-2-20 | |

MDJS 1200 Page 3 of 3 Printed: 03/04/2022 10:43 am

DOCKET



Docket Number: CP-02-CR-0000376-2022

CRIMINAL DOCKET

Court Case

Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

٧.

Page 1 of 4

Daniel Robert Cordera

CASE INFORMATION

Judge Assigned: Caulfield, Thomas P.

OTN: G 898600-3

LOTN:

Initial Issuing Authority: Ronald Arnoni
Arresting Agency: Bethel Park Police Dept

Complaint/Citation No.: ASAP-607525

Case Local Number Type(s)

Date Filed: 01/21/2022

Initiation Date: 11/02/2021

Originating Docket No: MJ-05220-CR-0000348-2021

<u>Final Issuing Authority:</u> Ronald Arnoni <u>Arresting Officer:</u> Alward, Cody P. <u>Incident Number:</u> 20211019M7083

Case Local Number(s)

STATUS INFORMATION

Case Status: Active S

Status Date

Processing Status

Arrest Date:

11/04/2021

03/03/2022 01/21/2022 01/21/2022 Awaiting Phoenix Conference Awaiting Formal Arraignment Awaiting Filing of Information

Complaint Date:

11/02/2021

CALENDAR EVENTS

Case Calendar
Event Type

Schedule Start Date Start Time

<u>Room</u>

Judge Name

Schedule

<u>Status</u>

Formal Arraignment
Phoenix Docket

03/03/2022 04/12/2022 11:00 am 8:30 am 519 Courthouse Courtroom 516

Judge Thomas P. Caulfield

Scheduled Scheduled

Conference

Date Of Birth:

10/17/1984

DEFENDANT INFORMATION

City/State/Zip: Pittsburgh, PA 15236

Alias Name

Cordera, Daniel

Cordera, Daniel

Cordera, Daniel R.

CASE PARTICIPANTS

Participant Type

<u>Name</u>

Defendant

Cordera, Daniel Robert

BAIL INFORMATION

Cordera, Daniel Robert

Bail Action

<u>Date</u>

Bail Type

Percentage

<u>Amount</u>

Posting Date

Set

01/13/2022

Nonmonetary

\$0.00

CHARGES

Seq. Orig Seq. Grade

Statute

Statule Description

Offense Dt.

Bail Posting Status

<u>OTN</u>

CPCMS 9082

Printed: 03/04/2022

Nebbia Status: None

Recent entries made in the court filing offices may not be immediately reflected on these docket sheets. Neither the courts of the Unified Judicial System of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assume any liability for inaccurate or delayed data, errors or omissions on these reports. Docket Sheet information should not be used in place of a criminal history background check which can only be provided by the Pennsylvania State Police. Moreover an employer who does not comply with the provisions of the Criminal History Record Information Act may be subject to civil liability as set forth in 18 Pa.C.S. Section 9183.

DOCKET



Docket Number: CP-02-CR-0000376-2022

CRIMINAL DOCKET

75 § 3802 §§ D1*

Court Case

Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

V.

Page 2 of 4

Daniel Robert Cordera

| <u>Seq.</u> | Orig Seq. | Grade | <u>Statule</u> | Statute Description | Offense Dt. | <u>OTN</u> |
|-------------|-----------|-------|------------------|--|-------------|------------|
| 1 | 6 | М | 75 § 3802 §§ D1* | DUI: Controlled Substance or Metabolite 1st Offense | 10/19/2021 | G 898600-3 |
| 2 | 1 | M | 75 § 3802 §§ D2* | DUI: Controlled Substance - Impaired Ability - 1st Offense | 10/19/2021 | G 898600-3 |
| 3 | 4 | S | 75 § 3361 | Driving at Safe Speed | 10/19/2021 | G 898600-3 |
| 4 | 3 | S | 75 § 3309 §§ 1 | Disregard Traffic Lane (Single) | 10/19/2021 | G 898600-3 |
| 99,999 | 5 | | 75 § 3802 §§ D1* | DUI: Controlled Substance or Metabolite 1st Offense | 10/19/2021 | G 898600-3 |
| 99,999 | 2 | S | 75 § 1501 §§ A | Driving W/O A License | 10/19/2021 | G 898600-3 |

DISPOSITION SENTENCING/PENALTIES

| — | | | |
|----------|-----|---|-----|
| DIS | DOS | н | חמו |

 Case Event
 Disposition Date
 Final Disposition

 Sequence/Description
 Offense Disposition
 Grade
 Section

 Sentencing Judge
 Sentence Date
 Credit For Time Served

 Sentence/Diversion Program Type
 Incarceration/Diversionary Period
 Start Date

Sentence Conditions

| Walved for Court (Lower Court) | Defendant Was Pr | resent | | |
|---|----------------------|--------------------------------|-----------|------------------|
| Lower Court Disposition | | 01/13/2022 | Not Final | |
| 2 / DUI: Controlled Substance - Im Offense | paired Ability - 1st | Waived for Court (Lower Court) | M | 75 § 3802 §§ D2* |
| 3 / Driving at Safe Speed | | Waived for Court (Lower Court) | s | 75 § 3361 |
| 4 / Disregard Traffic Lane (Single) | | Waived for Court (Lower Court) | S | 75 § 3309 §§ 1 |
| 99,999 / Driving W/O A License | | Withdrawn (Lower Court) | s | 75 § 1501 §§ A |

Waived for Court (Lower Court)

| 1 | |
|------------------|---------------------------|
| Proceed to Court | Defendant Was Not Present |

99,999 / DUI: Controlled Substance or Metabolite 1st

| i roceed to court | Deletionit Mas Mot Liesellt | | | |
|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------------------|-----------|------------------|
| Information Filed | | 02/24/2022 | Not Final | |
| 1 / DUI: Controlled Sc | bstance or Metabolite 1st Offense | Replacement by Information | M | 75 § 3802 §§ D1* |
| 2 / DUI: Controlled Su Offense | ibstance - Impaired Ability - 1st | Proceed to Court | М | 75 § 3802 §§ D2* |
| 3 / Driving at Safe Sp | eed | Proceed to Court | s | 75 § 3361 |
| 4 / Disregard Traffic L | ane (Single) | Proceed to Court | s | 75 § 3309 §§ 1 |
| 99,999 / Driving W/O | A License | Withdrawn | S | 75 § 1501 §§ A |
| 99,999 / DUI: Controll | ed Substance or Metabolite 1st | Charge Changed | | 75 § 3802 §§ D1* |
| | | | | |

Offense

Offense

Replaced by 75 § 3802 §§ D1*, DUI: Controlled Substance or Metabolite 1st Offense

CPCMS 9082 Printed: 03/04/2022

Recent entries made in the court filing offices may not be immediately reflected on these docket sheets. Neither the courts of the Unified Judicial System of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assume any liability for inaccurate or delayed data, errors or omissions on these reports. Docket Sheet information should not be used in place of a criminal history background check which can only be provided by the Pennsylvania State Police. Moreover an employer who does not comply with the provisions of the Criminal History Record Information Act may be subject to civil liability as set forth in 18 Pa.C.S. Section 9183.

DOCKET



Docket Number: CP-02-CR-0000376-2022

CRIMINAL DOCKET

Court Case

Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

٧.

Page 3 of 4

Daniel Robert Cordera

COMMONWEALTH INFORMATION

Name:

Allegheny County District Attorney's

Office, Criminal Division

Prosecutor

Supreme Court No: Phone Number(s):

412-350-4403

(Phone)

Address:

436 Grant Street

Allegheny County Court House

Pittsburgh, PA 15219

ATTORNEY INFORMATION

lame:

Michael Dewitt Barry *

Public Defender

Supreme Court No:

330589 Lower Court

Rep. Status:

Phone Number(s):

412-350-2400

(Phone)

Address:

Allegheny County Public Defender's Office

542 Forbes Ave # 400 Pittsburgh, PA 15219

Representing: Cordera, Daniel Robert
* Entry of Appearance Not Filed

ENTRIES

Sequence Number

CP Filed Date

Document Date

Filed By

Arnoni, Ronald

01/13/2022

Bail Set - Cordera, Daniel Robert

01/21/2022

Court of Common Pleas - Allegheny

County

Original Papers Received from Lower Court

Allegheny County District Attorney's

Office, Criminal Division

01/21/2022

eService

Served

2

01/21/2022

Criminal Division - Allegheny

Formal Arraignment Scheduled 03/03/2022 11:00AM

Allegheny County District Attorney's

Office, Criminal Division

01/21/2022

eService

Served

1

02/24/2022

Allegheny County District Attorney's

Office

Guideline Sentence Form

Allegheny County District Attorney's

Office, Criminal Division

02/24/2022

eService

Served

2

02/24/2022

Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Information Filed

Allegheny County District Attorney's

Office, Criminal Division

CPCMS 9082 Printed: 03/04/2022

Recent entries made in the court filing offices may not be immediately reflected on these docket sheets. Neither the courts of the Unified Judicial System of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania nor the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts assume any liability for inaccurate or delayed data, errors or omissions on these reports. Docket Sheet information should not be used in place of a criminal history background check which can only be provided by the Pennsylvania State Police. Moreover an employer who does not comply with the provisions of the Criminal History Record Information Act may be subject to civil liability as set forth in 18 Pa.C.S. Section 9183.

DOCKET



Docket Number: CP-02-CR-0000376-2022

CRIMINAL DOCKET

Court Case

Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

٧.

Page 4 of 4

Daniel Robert Cordera

ENTRIES

Sequence Number CP Filed Date

Document Date

Filed By

Service To

Service By

<u>Issue Date</u> 02/24/2022 Service Type eService Status Date

Service Status

Served

CPCMS 9082 Printed: 03/04/2023